



Validation Report

Advancing Tree Equity in Providence – 2021

Document Prepared by City Forest Credits

September 12, 2022

PROJECT OVERVIEW

<i>Project Name</i>	Advancing Tree Equity in Providence – 2021
<i>Project Registry Number</i>	022
<i>Project Type</i>	Tree Planting
<i>City Forest Credits Protocol Version</i>	Version 9, February 7, 2021
<i>Project Start Date</i>	November 10, 2021
<i>Project Location</i>	Providence, Rhode Island
<i>Project Operator</i>	American Forests

SUMMARY

This Validation Report is for the initial crediting after planting in Year 0.

Between April 18, 2020 and November 10, 2021, the Providence Neighborhood Planting Program (PNPP) planted 1,120 trees across the city of Providence, Rhode Island. Trees were planted using the single tree planting design and quantification method including: 1,039 trees planted along the city right-of-way (sidewalks, lawn strips, and medians) and 81 trees planted on other city-owned and managed properties (schools, fire stations, and parks).

PNPP and the City of Providence used American Forests’ Tree Equity Score Analyzer (TESA) to identify priority areas for tree planting. Rhode Island is the first state in the nation to receive a TESA, a state-of-the-art tool that combines demographic, health, urban heat island and tree canopy data and displays it on an interactive map that identifies priority locations for planting and protecting trees. PNPP used TESA to assess where trees were most needed ensuring that this tree planting project will improve Tree Equity Scores and bring the many co-benefits of urban tree canopy to those most in need.

PNPP achieved this through their community-driven tree planting model, working with residents and community groups to identify planting sites and working with neighborhood volunteers to plant the trees. Neighborhoods with lower Tree Equity Scores were prioritized to receive new trees in order to cool neighborhoods and improve air quality that disproportionately impacts Providence’s lowest canopy neighborhoods. Many of these sites are in formerly redlined neighborhoods where there are larger populations of people of color and people in poverty, and where the public health and social burdens correlated with tree inequity and other forms of environmental racism are most present.

ELIGIBILITY

Project Operator Identity (Section 1.1)

Criteria

Under Tree Planting Protocol Version 9, a Project requires at least one Project Operator (“PO”), an entity organized and licensed under the laws of its jurisdiction, or a governmental body, which undertakes a Project, registers it with the registry of City Forest Credits (the “Registry”), and is ultimately responsible for all aspects of the project and its reporting. While not required for Tree Planting Protocol Version 9,

City Forest Credits recommended that Project Operators provide documentation regarding their identity.

Issue Validated

American Forests is the Project Operator and provided the following documentation to City Forest Credits to demonstrate that it is an entity organized and licensed under the laws of its jurisdiction: the IRS Determination Letter granting American Forests its 501c3 status.

Project Submittal Dates (Section 7)

Criteria

Under Tree Planting Protocol Version 10, Project must submit applications to the Registry within six months of the date of the planting of the last tree that is part of the planting project. Projects with plantings prior to May 1, 2017 are not eligible. While the six-month deadline was not required for Tree Planting Protocol Version 9, City Forest Credits recommended that Project Operators submit the application within that timeframe.

Issue Validated

Project Operator submitted the application on December 16, 2021, which was within 6 months of the date of planting the last project tree (November 10, 2021).

Permanence – Project Duration and Reversals (Section 1.2,5, 10)

A. Project Duration – Project Implementation Agreement (Section 1.2 and 5)

Criteria

Project Operator must sign a Project Implementation Agreement with the Registry setting forth the Project Operator's obligation to comply with the protocol. Project Operator must monitor and report for 25 years.

Issue Validated

Project Operator American Forests and City Forest Credits signed a Project Implementation Agreement with effective date of February 28, 2022 for Advancing Tree Equity in Providence – 2021 (Project Registry Number 022). The project has a 25-year duration under City Forest Credits Tree Planting Protocol Version 9.

B. Reversals (Section 10)

Criteria

A "Reversal" is loss of stored carbon such that the remaining stored carbon within the Project Area is less than the amount of stored carbon for which Registry credits have been issued. The Registry will retain in a Reversal Pool account 5% of all credits issued to planting projects. This Reversal Pool account shall be used to compensate for Unavoidable Reversals.

Issue Validated

The Project Design Document and request for credits based on GHG mitigation includes a 5% deduction for the Reversal Pool account of credits.

Project Location (Section 1.3)

Criteria

Project Area must be located in parcels within or along the boundary of at least one of the urban area criteria. The Project Operator must specify the Project Area and provide an electronic map of the Project area.

Issue Validated

The Project is located in the municipal boundaries of Providence, Rhode Island (incorporated city), which meets protocol criteria Section 1.3B. The Project Operator has provided maps as supporting evidence, including regional-scale and project area maps.

Project Area (Section 8)

Criteria

The Project Operator may include more than one planting site in a project. The initial planting of trees for all properties in a project must occur within a 36-month period or less.

Issue Validated

The Project includes 1,120 trees planted on city-owned land over a 19-month period. The trees were planted between April 18, 2020 and November 10, 2021. The Project Operator signed an Attestation of Planting and provided photos and a statement from the City of Providence to confirm the planting numbers. The Project Operator provided a signed Attestation of Planting Affirmation from Providence Neighborhood Planting Program.

Ownership or Eligibility to Receive Potential Credits (Section 2)

Criteria

Project Operator must demonstrate ownership of potential credits or eligibility to receive potential credits.

Issue Validated

The City of Providence is the landowner for the Advancing Tree Equity in Providence – 2021 project. The Project Operator provided an Agreement from Owner to Transfer Potential Credits as supporting documentation, signed by the Project Operator and the City of Providence effective November 12, 2021, meeting protocol criteria Section 2C.

Additionality (Section 4)

Criteria

The City Forest Credits Standard and Tree Planting Protocol ensure additionality for every carbon project. A project activity is additional if it can be demonstrated that the activity results in emission reductions or removals that are in excess of what would be achieved under a “business as usual” scenario and the activity would not have occurred in the absence of the incentive period provided by the carbon markets.

Projects must demonstrate the following:

- A Legal Requirements Test that declares city trees planted due to an enacted law or ordinance not eligible (Section 4B);
- Either 1) a project-specific baseline or 2) the current version of the Registry’s performance standard baseline developed in adherence with the WRI GHG Protocol (CFC Standard);
- Project Operators must sign and comply with a Project Implementation Agreement with the Registry that requires a 25-year Project Duration.

Issue Validated

Project Operator has met the Legal Requirements Test that the trees were not planted due to an enacted ordinance or law. Project Operator used the Registry’s performance standard baseline in adherence with the WRI GHG Protocol, which is attached to the Project Design Document. Project Operator signed a Project Implementation Agreement with the Registry for a 25-year Project Duration.

Project Operator has signed an Attestation of Planting and the Project Design Document statements that confirms the above, as well as stating that the 25-year Project Duration is in addition to and longer than any commitment the Project Operator makes to non-carbon project tree plantings and that trees were not planted on sites that were forested and then cleared of trees within the prior 10 years.

No Double Counting and No Net Harm

Criteria

The Tree Planting Protocol Version 10 describes prevention of double-counting in Section 5.1 and the “No Net Harm” Principle in Section 5.2. Project activities shall not cause net harm to the environment or urban communities. While not required under Tree Planting Protocol Version 9, CFC recommended that the Project Operator sign an Attestation of No Double Counting of Credits and No Net Harm.

Issue Validated

Project Operator has submitted a signed Attestation of No Double Counting of Credits and a signed Attestation of No Net Harm, and the Registry sees no evidence of net harm from this project. The Registry has reviewed the records of prior projects to confirm that the Project Area for this project has not already received credits under the CFC Standard.

Carbon Quantification (Section 12 and Appendix B)

Criteria

Project Operator must follow the quantification methods outlined in Appendix B of the Protocol.

Issue Validated

Project Operator used the single tree planting design and quantification method, per Protocol criteria in Section 12 and Appendix B. Project Operator signed the Attestation of Planting with confirmation documents, including a statement from the City of Providence and planting photos. Project Operator provided an Attestation of Planting Affirmation signed by Providence Neighborhood Planting Program.

The Carbon Quantification Summary is as follows:

Total number of trees planted	1120
Project area (acres), if applicable	n/a
Total number of trees per acre, if applicable	n/a
Credits attributed to the project (tCO ₂ e)	1022.3
Credits after mortality deduction (default is 20%)	817.8
Contribution to Registry Reversal Pool Account (5%) (tCO ₂ e)	40.9
Total credits to be issued to the Project Operator (tCO₂e)	776.9
Total credits requested to be issued in Year 1 (10% of above)	78

Project Operator asserts that the Project results in GHG emissions mitigation of 776.9 tons CO₂e. Project Operator will sample trees, quantify tons CO₂e, and submit documentation for verification and credit issuance at Year 4, 6, and after Year 25 per the Tree Protocol Version 9 and Single Tree Quantification Methodology.

Project Operator asserts that the Project results in GHG emissions mitigation of 78 tons CO₂e after initial tree planting.

Co-Benefits Quantification (Section 12 and Appendix B)

Criteria

Project Operator must follow the co-benefit quantification methods for rainfall interception, air quality, and energy savings.

Issue Validated

Project Operator has followed the co-benefits quantification method using the templates provided by City Forest Credits. The following table documents the quantified ecosystem services in resource units and avoided costs per year when Project Trees reach 25 years old.

<i>Ecosystem Services</i>	<i>Resource Units</i>	<i>Value</i>
Rainfall Interception (m ³ /yr)	7,142.36	\$15,094.51
Air Quality (t/yr)	0.4764	\$5,715.86
Energy: Cooling – Electricity (kWh/yr)	93,201.26	\$13,057.50
Energy: Heating – Natural Gas (kBtu/yr)	3,467,234.39	\$48,493.53
Grand Total (\$/yr)		\$82,361.39

Monitoring and Reporting (Appendix A)

Criteria

Project Operator must report on tree conditions across the Project Area for the Project Duration. Reports must be submitted annually on the anniversary of the date of the first Verification Report. At Years 4, 6, and 25, sampling, measurement of trees or canopy coverage, and/or quantification of CO₂e will be submitted for request of credit issuance in lieu of a monitoring report that year.

Issue Validated

Project Operator has agreed to submit written annual monitoring reports using the template provided by City Forest Credits. Monitoring plans have been described in the Project Design Document.

VERIFICATION REPORT

CFC reviewed the Verification Report dated August 29, 2022 by Dan Hintz, a Validation and Verification Body, to ensure it accurately reflects the documentation contained in the Project Design Document and supporting documents.

VALIDATION CONCLUSION

I attest that all the information provided in this validation report is free of material misstatement, to the best of my knowledge. The project complies with the validation criteria outlined in the City Forest Credits Standard and Tree Planting Protocol Version 9.