

# **CITY FOREST CREDITS** (URBAN FOREST CARBON REGISTRY)

## Tree Preservation Protocol – 100 Years

Version 5 February 21, 2018



Urban Forest Carbon Registry, City Forest Credits, a 501(c)(3) non-profit organization 999 Third Ave. #4600 Seattle, WA 98104 info@cityforestcredits.org (206) 623-1823

*Copyright © 2016-2018 Urban Forest Carbon Registry and City Forest Credits. All rights reserved.* 

## Drafting Group

Zach Baumer	Mark McPherson
Climate Program Mgr.	Ex. Dir.
City of Austin	City Forest Credits
Rich Dolesh	Darren Morgan
VP Conservation & Parks	Manager
National Recreation and Park	Seattle DOT
Association	Walter Passmore
Heather Sage	City Forester
Dir. of Community Projects	City of Palo Alto
Pittsburgh Parks Conservancy	Shannon Ramsay
Ian Leahy	Founder
Dir. of UF Programs	Trees Forever
American Forests	Misha Sarkovich
Scott Maco	Customer Solutions
Dir. of Research & Dev.	Sacramento Municipal Utility District
Davey Institute	
	Skip Swenson
Jenny McGarvey	VP
Forest Programs Mgr.	Forterra
Alliance for Chesapeake Bay	Andy Trotter
Greg McPherson	VP of Field Ops.
Research Scientist	West Coast Arborists
U.S. Forest Service	
	Gordon Smith
	Ecofor Seattle

## Table of Contents

		Page
Drafting (	Group	i
Introducti	on	1
Documen	ts and Standards for Protocol Development	2
Recogniti	on of Distinct Urban Forest Issues in Protocol Development	4
1.	Eligibility Requirements	6
1.1	Project Operators	6
1.2	Project Implementation Agreement	6
1.3	Project Location	6
1.4	Defining the Project Area	7
1.5	Ownership or Eligibility to Receive Potential Credits	8
2.	Project Duration	9
3.	Project Documentation, Reporting, and Record-keeping	9
4.	Demonstrating Preservation and Threat of Loss	10
5.	Project Commencement	12
6.	Issuance of Credits for Tree Preservation Projects	12
7.	Monitoring	13
8.	Reversals in Tree Preservation Projects	14

9.	Continuation of Tree Preservation Projects after 40-Year Project Duration 16
10.	Quantification for Credits16
10.1	Quantifying Biomass Carbon Stock Present Within the Project Area17
10.2	Areas Expected to Remain in Trees After Potential Development20
10.3	Re-measurement of Carbon Stock Necessary to Claim Additional Credits for Growth21
10.4	Quantification of Soil Carbon21
10.5	Calculation of Deduction for Displaced Development
10.6	Reversal Pool25
11.	Verification25
11.1	Verification of Eligibility Requirements26
12.	Verification of Project Operator's Quantification of Carbon27
12.1	Quantifying Biomass Carbon Stock Within the Project Area under Section 10.1
12.2	Area Expected to Remain Treed after Development Under Section 10.229
12.3	Additional or Ongoing Growth Under Section 10.3
12.4	Quantification of Soil Carbon Under Section 10.4
12.5	Displaced Development Under Section 10.5
12.6	Total Credits Attributed to the Project32

### Introduction

This City Forest Carbon Protocol sets forth the requirements for Tree Preservation projects in urban areas in the U.S. to quantify carbon dioxide sequestration from woody biomass. That woody biomass is referred to herein by the broader term "urban forest."

This protocol provides eligibility rules, methods for quantifying biomass and CO<sub>2</sub> storage, and reporting, monitoring, issuance of credits, reversal, and verification requirements. We have been guided in our drafting by one of the foundational documents for carbon protocols, the World Resources Institute/World Business Council for Sustainable Development Greenhouse Gas Protocol for Project Accounting, which describes greenhouse gas ("GHG") project accounting principles. We refer to this document as the WRI GHG Protocol.

Our goal is in this protocol is to provide for accounting of net GHG reductions is a consistent, transparent, and accurate manner, consistent with the principles and policies set forth in the WRI GHG Protocol document. This process will form the basis for GHG reductions that are real, additional, permanent, verifiable, and enforceable, which can then result in the issuance by the registry of City Forest Credits of carbon credits, called City Forest Carbon+ Credits<sup>™</sup>.

Urban forests in the U.S. are estimated to store over 643 million tonnes of  $CO_2$ .<sup>1</sup> The co-benefits of urban forests include air quality improvements, energy savings from reduction of the urban heat island effect, slope stability, bird and wildlife habitat, sound and visual buffering, public health improvements, safety, livability,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Nowak, David J., et al. "Carbon storage and sequestration by trees in urban and community areas of the United States." *Environmental Pollution* 178 (2013): 229-236, 231.

social cohesiveness, economic improvements, and more.<sup>2</sup> Urban trees clearly influence air temperatures and energy and affect local climate, carbon cycles, and climate change.<sup>3</sup>

Moreover, almost 80% of the population worldwide lives in urban areas, and urbanization is a significant demographic trend of the 21<sup>st</sup> century. The array of benefits delivered by urban trees directly links to human health and life in cities and towns.

#### Documents and Standards for Protocol Development

No single authoritative body regulates carbon protocols or determines final standards. The Stockholm Environment Institute's Carbon Offset Research and Education resource lists the various institutions and programs that have set out formulations of basic principles that every carbon offset protocol should contain.<sup>4</sup>

CORE lists twenty-five different programs or institutions that have either developed standards for protocols or issued standards and rules for their own programs. These institutions range from international bodies such as the Kyoto Protocol, the World Resources Institute, and the International Organization for Standardization, to U.S. carbon programs such as the Regional Greenhouse Gas Initiative and Midwest Greenhouse Gas Reduction Accord, to registries such as the American Carbon Registry, the Climate Action Reserve, and the Verified Carbon Standard.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See Alliance for Community Trees, Benefits of Urban Forests: a Research List at http://www.actrees.org/files/Research/benefits\_of\_trees.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Nowak, 229.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> See CORE at http://www.co2offsetresearch.org/policy/ComparisonTableAdditionality.html

The standards issued by these bodies vary, and the specific rules formulated to give content to these different standards vary even more. For example, the Clean Development Mechanism under the UN Framework stemming from the Kyoto Protocol lists 115 different approved baseline and monitoring methodologies for large scale offset projects.

To complicate matters, the environmental and carbon community have tolerated a de facto different standard between compliance protocols and voluntary protocols. Compliance protocols exist in cap and trade jurisdictions like California. Because these compliance protocols establish the rules for credits that will offset actual regulated GHG emissions from monitored sources, greater rigor is expected than in voluntary protocols, where purchasers are buying credits voluntarily to reduce their carbon footprint, not to offset regulated emissions.

There is, nonetheless, a general consensus that all carbon offset protocols must contain the following:

- Accounting Rules: offsets must be "real, additional, and permanent." These rules cover eligibility requirements and usually include baselines for additionality, quantification methodologies, and permanence standards.
- Monitoring, Reporting, Verification Rules: monitoring, reporting, and verification rules ensure that credits are real and verifiable.

Certification, enforceability, and tracking of credits and reversals are performed by specific programs or registries, guided by language in the protocol where relevant.

Over the last fifteen years, several documents setting forth standard and principles for protocols have emerged as consensus leaders for programs attempting to develop their own offset protocols for specific project types. We will follow and refer most often to:

- WRI GHG Protocol;
- Clean Development Mechanism, Kyoto Protocol, now part of the UN Framework Convention on Climate Change ("CDM").

We have been guided by the WRI GHG Protocol and have modelled this urban Tree Preservation Protocol after the "avoided conversion" protocols that have been developed for forest land. Further discussion of protocol principles and requirements will be posted soon discussing both the Tree Planting and the Tree Preservation Protocols.

## Recognition of Distinct Urban Forest Issues in Protocol Development

The task for the City Forest Drafting Group was to take the principles and standards set forth in these foundational documents and adapt them to urban forestry. Urban and community forestry and its potential carbon projects are different than virtually all other types of carbon projects:

- Urban forests are essentially public goods, producing benefits far beyond the specific piece of land upon which individual trees are planted.
- New tree planting in urban areas is almost universally done by non-profit entities, cities or towns, quasi-governmental bodies like utilities, and private property owners.
- Except for a relatively small number of wood utilization projects, urban trees are not merchantable, are not harvested, and generate no revenue or profit.

- With the exception of very recent plantings begun in California using funds from its Greenhouse Gas Reduction Fund, no one currently plants urban trees with carbon as a decisive reason for doing the planting.
- Because urban tree planting and maintenance are expensive relative to carbon revenues, urban forestry has not attracted established for-profit carbon developers.
- Because urban forest projects will take place in urban areas, they will be highly visible to the public and easily visited by carbon buyers. This contrasts with most carbon projects that are designed to generate tradeable credits purchased in volume by distant and "blind" buyers.

During the drafting process, we remained mindful at all times that the above unique factors of urban forestry distill down to three central attributes:

- Urban trees deliver a broad array of documented environmental and human health benefits,
- Urban trees are essentially a public good delivering their array of environmental benefits to the people and communities living in cities and towns – almost 80% of the population, and
- There are little to no harvests, revenues, or profits for those who preserve and grow the urban forest.

These three key attributes lead to the conclusion that urban forest projects are highly desirable, bringing multiple benefits to 80% of the population in a public good that is unlikely to be gamed or exploited.

Our task then was to draft urban forest protocols that encouraged participation in urban forest projects through highly-credible protocols that addressed not just catch-phrase principles of carbon protocols, but the policies underlying those principles. Where the needs of urban forest practicality required a variance from accepted principles of carbon protocols, we developed solutions to those variances to maintain a high level of stringency.

## 1. Eligibility Requirements

#### 1.1 Project Operators

A Project requires at least one Project Operator ("PO"), an individual or an entity, who undertakes a Project, registers it with the registry of City Forest Credits (the "Registry"), and is ultimately responsible for the project and its reporting.

#### 1.2 Project Implementation Agreement

A Project Operator must sign a Project Implementation Agreement (PIA) with the Registry setting forth the Project Operator's obligation to comply with this Protocol.

#### 1.3 Project Location

Project Areas must be located in parcels within or along the boundary of at least one of the following:

- A. The Urban Area boundary ("Urban Area"), defined by the most recent publication of the United States Census Bureau (https://www.census.gov/geo/maps-data/maps/2010ua.html);
- B. The boundary of any incorporated city or town created under the law of its state;
- C. The boundary of any unincorporated city, town, or unincorporated urban area created or designated under the law of its state;

- D. The boundary of land owned, designated, and used by a municipal or quasi-municipal entity such as a utility for source water or water shed protection;
- E. A transportation, power transmission, or utility right of way, provided the right of way begins, ends, or passes through some portion of A, B, C, or D above.

If the parcel containing the Project Area lies along but outside the boundary of one of the above, some part of the property line of the parcel containing the Project Area must be coterminous with that boundary. Project Area that lies outside the boundary of A, B, C, or D above may be within or across multiple parcels, provided that each parcel is contiguous with at least one of the other parcels containing the Project Area, and that some part of the property line of one of the parcels is coterminous with the boundary of A, B, C, or D above.

#### 1.4 Defining the Project Area

The Project Operator must specify the Project Area and provide an electronic map of the Project Area with geospatial location in any file type that can be imported and read by Google Earth Pro.

The Project Area must

 A. Be within one of the areas specified in Section 1.3 on Project Location. The Project Area may consist of contiguous or noncontiguous parcels, subject to the requirements of Section 1.3. Project Area boundaries do not have to follow land parcel boundaries; and

- B. Meet the requirements of Section 4.3; and
- C. Have at least 80% tree canopy in locations that receive at least 20 inches of precipitation per year or 60% tree canopy in locations that receive less than 20 inches of precipitation per year

Precipitation may be determined by maps produced by a government agency, or from the average of the most recent ten years of data from the nearest government precipitation measurement station for which data is publicly available.

Forests naturally have spaces between trees and gaps, and locations of these gaps may change over time. The Project Operator may choose to map gaps in the forest and exclude those non-treed areas from the Project Area. If the Project Operator does not exclude gaps from the Project Area, determination of the carbon stock and sequestration on the Project Area must account for tree canopy gaps using a method that is consistent with the methods for quantifying Project Stock in Section 10.1.A.

#### 1.5 Ownership or Eligibility to Receive Potential Credits

The Project Operator must demonstrate ownership of potential credits or eligibility to receive potential credits by meeting at least one of the following:

- A. Own the land and potential credits upon which the Project trees are located; or
- B. Own an easement or equivalent property interest for a public right of way within which Project trees are located and accept ownership

8

of those Project trees by assuming responsibility for maintenance and liability for them; or

C. Have a written and signed agreement from the landowner, committing the landowner to actions, or refraining from actions, required under the Protocol, including allowing the Project Operator and the Registry to quantify, or verify data required under this Protocol, and granting ownership to the Project Operator of any credits for carbon storage, other greenhouse gas benefits, and other co-benefits delivered by Project trees on that landowner's land. If the Project Area is on private property, the agreements in this sub-section must be recorded in the public records in the county where the property is located. The recordation requirement can be satisfied if the agreements specified in this sub-section are contained in a recorded easement on the property.

#### 2. Project Duration

As set forth in Section 6, the Registry will issue credits based on at least a 100-year Preservation Commitment (see Section 4.1 for definition of Preservation Commitment). Project Operators must monitor and report under Section 7 throughout their Preservation Commitment. Projects may earn credits after 100 years as provided in Section 8.

#### 3. Project Documentation, Reporting, and Record-keeping

Documentation, reporting, and record-keeping requirements are contained in Appendix A.

#### 4. Demonstrating Preservation and Threat of Loss

To earn credits for Tree Preservation projects (Trees Preserved from Removal), a Project Operator must meet the requirements of Sections 4.1, 4.2, and 4.3:

- 4.1 That the trees in the Project Area have been preserved as follows (the actions in A and B below are referred to as the "Preservation Commitment"):
  - A. If the Project Area is privately owned, that the trees are preserved from removal by a recorded easement with a term of at least 100 years. Or,
  - B. If the Project Area is publicly owned, that the trees are preserved from removal by either:
    - i. A recorded easement with a term of at least 100 years; or
    - ii. A management plan or protected status, adopted by the governmental body with authority over that land, which preserves the trees in the Project Area from removal for at least 100 years ("Governmental Preservation of Trees on Public Land").

And,

4.2 That prior to the Preservation Commitment in Subsection 4.1 above, the project trees were not preserved from removal through easements, Governmental Preservation of Trees on Public Land, or other prohibitions on their removal, and

- 4.3 That prior to the Preservation Commitment in Subsection 4.1 above, the Project Area meets A below and at least one of B, C, or D:
  - A. Was in a land use designation that allows for at least one non-forest use (non-forest uses include industrial, commercial, transportation, residential, agricultural, or resource other than forest, as well as non-forest park, recreation, or open space uses), and is not in an overlay zone that prohibits all development (the words "overlay zone" are intended to include prohibitions on development such as critical areas or wetlands designations, but if a Project Operator believes an overlay zone allows development, the Project Operator may submit the facts to the Registry and seek a determination that it has met the requirements of Section 4.3.A) ; and at least one of conditions B, C, or D:
  - B. Was surrounded on at least 50% of its perimeter by non-forest, developed, or improved uses, including residential, commercial, or industrial; if the Project Area is surrounded by forested land, the 50% perimeter can apply to the surrounding forested land; or
  - C. Had been sold or conveyed or had an assessed value within three years of preservation under Subsection 4.1 for greater than \$10,000 average price per acre for the bare land; or
  - D. Would have a fair market value after conversion to a nonforested "highest and best use" greater than the fair market value prior to preservation in subsection 4.1, as stated in a

"highest and best use" study from a state certified general real estate appraiser in good standing.

#### 5. Project Commencement

Projects must submit applications to the Registry within one year of recording of an easement or adoption of Governmental Preservation of Trees on Public Land per subsection 4.1 above. Easements or Governmental Preservation of Trees on Public Land adoptions prior to November 1, 2017 are not eligible.

Projects commence upon approval of the application by the Registry. The Commencement date triggers the scheduled dates for monitoring.

### 6. Issuance of Credits for Tree Preservation Projects

The Registry will issue City Forest Carbon+ Credits<sup>™</sup>, representing a tonne of carbon dioxide equivalent (CO<sub>2</sub>e) per credit plus other ecosystem benefits.

If the Project Area is less than 20 acres, the Project may quantify CO<sub>2</sub> eligible for crediting and request issuance of credits at any time after the Project Commencement date, subject to the provisions below.

If the Project Area is greater than 20 acres and not more than 200 acres, the Project may quantify CO<sub>2</sub> eligible for crediting and, at any time after Project Commencement, request issuance of credits attributable to the equivalent of 20 acres of the Project. At each subsequent annual anniversary of the original issuance of credits, the project may request issuance of credits attributable to the equivalent of 20 more acres of the Project, until all attributed credits have been issued, using the most recent verified amount of offsets attributed to the Project.

For example, if the Project Area is 60 acres, the Project Operator would quantify the CO<sub>2</sub> eligible for crediting on all 60 acres, and then the Project is eligible to be issued one third of the total number of credits attributed to the project each year for three years (one-third being the equivalent of 20 acres), and with all credits for the project thus issued by the end of the third year.

If the Project Area is greater than 200 acres, the Project may quantify CO<sub>2</sub> eligible for crediting and, at any time after Project Commencement, request issuance of credits attributable to the equivalent of 10% of the total credits attributed to the Project. The Project can quantify all CO<sub>2</sub> eligible for crediting for the Project Area and request issuance of 10% of the credits each year, until all credits have been issued.

In all Tree Preservation projects, the Registry will issue 90% of credits earned and requested and will hold 10% in the Registry's Reversal Pool. At the end of the Project Duration, if application of Registry accounting methods shows that the project has generated more credits than the Project has been issued, then, (if the Project requests) the Registry will issue to the Project those excess credits. Amounts of credits to be issued under the provisions of this section are gross amounts and include amounts to be issued to both the Project Operator and amounts to be transferred to the Registry's Reversal Pool.

Tree Preservation projects must follow the quantification methods and seek verification per sections 9 and 10.

#### 7. Monitoring

At least once every three years, the Project Operator must observe tree conditions across the Project Area and report these conditions to the Registry. These reports must be in writing, may be based on professional judgment, and the Project Operator must attest to the accuracy of the reports. The reports must estimate the percentage of the Project Area that appears to be gaining biomass carbon, the percent of the Project Area that appears to have constant biomass carbon stocks, and the percent of the Project Area that appears to be losing biomass carbon stock. If any area appears to be losing carbon stock, the report shall state the estimated amount of loss. The report shall also estimate the number of acres of significant soil disturbance that has occurred since the previous report. Plowing and removal of topsoil both constitute significant soil disturbance. For the purposes of these reports, areas of soil exposed by trees tipping over are not counted as areas of significant soil disturbance.

If a Project Operator fails to monitor or to report under this Section 7, the Registry can investigate and take actions including cancellation of the Project and all credits issued.

#### 8. Reversals in Tree Preservation Projects

Reversals are the loss of biomass carbon ("Loss of Biomass Carbon") after credits have been received by projects but before the expiration of the Preservation Commitment. If there is loss of biomass carbon such that the remaining biomass carbon within the project area may be less than the amount of biomass carbon for which Registry credits have been issued, then the Project must estimate the amount of remaining carbon and report this estimate within 60 days of becoming aware of the loss.

The Registry shall determine, at its own discretion, whether a reversal was the result of intentional action or gross negligence by the Project Operator or property owner. If a Reversal was not the result of intentional action or gross negligence, the Registry will replace offsets invalidated by the Reversal with credits from the Registry's Reversal or Insurance Pool.

If the Registry determines that the Reversal was the result of an intentional action or gross negligence by the Project Operator, the Registry shall estimate the number of remaining creditable tonnes CO2e using whatever estimation methods the Registry deems appropriate. The Registry shall notify the Project Operator of this count. If the Registry determines that more credits have been issued to the Project (counting both credits issued to the Project Operator and credits transferred to the Registry's offset insurance account), the Registry shall notify the Project Operator of this shortfall. The Project Operator shall be responsible for replacing the number of credits that have been issued but that are no longer supported by carbon storage within the Project Area. Within 60 days of being notified of the number of credits that it is obligated to replace, the Project Operator shall submit to the Registry a sufficient number of City Forest Carbon+ Credits to cover the shortfall. If the Project Operator is unable to obtain sufficient City Forest Carbon+ Credits, the Project Operator may pay the Registry \$20 per tonne CO<sub>2</sub>e of shortfall to satisfy the Project Operator's reversal obligation.

Quantifications of carbon stocks determined by the Registry shall be considered to be verified amounts.

If the Project Operator disputes the Registry's reversal calculation, the Project Operator may, at its own expense, measure the remaining carbon stocks within the Project Area that may be more accurate than estimates made by the Registry. The Registry shall consider carbon stock counts submitted to it by the Project Operator, and if the Registry finds that the Project Operator's count is likely to be more accurate than the Registry's estimate, the Registry shall use the Project Operator's count of carbon stocks to determine the Project Operator's liability for replacing credits that are no longer supported by carbon storage within the Project Area.

If a Project has had its carbon stock go below the carbon stock necessary to support credits issued by the Registry, no further credits will be issued to the Project until the carbon stocks are above the amounts needed to support issued credits, including credits allocated to the Registry's offset insurance account.

If a Project Operator fails to compensate for a reversal, that Operator may be barred, at the sole discretion of the Registry, from submitting applications to the Registry...

The above provisions will be incorporated into a Project Implementation Agreement between the Project Operator and the Registry.

## 9. Continuation of Tree Preservation Projects after 100-Year Project Duration

After a 100-year Preservation Commitment, Tree Preservation projects may continue their activities, submit Project Reports under Appendix A, and seek issuance of credits for growth under Section 10.3. Projects must comply with all applicable requirements of this Protocol.

## 10. Quantification for Credits

The Registry will issue City Forest Carbon+ Credits<sup>™</sup> to a Project only after quantification by a Project Operator, verification by the Registry, and a request for issuance of credits by a Project Operator. Project Operators must follow the following Quantification methods.

There are five steps in the quantification of credits generated by a Project. These steps are described in full in this section, beginning with sub-section 10.1. In summary, the five steps are:

- 1. Estimate the biomass stock present, and adjust for uncertainty in the estimate to calculate the "Accounting Stock" (Section 10.1)
- Calculate the fraction of the Accounting Stock that likely would be emitted as a result of development, to calculate "Avoided Biomass Emissions" (Section 10.2)
- The Project Operator may elect to also account for growth of trees within the project area, or may choose not to count growth (Section 10.3)
- 4. Calculate "Avoided Soil Carbon Emissions" (Section 10.4)
- 5. Calculate the number of credits generated by the Project by either (a) demonstrating that development displaced by the project can be accommodated by development or redevelopment of parcels within the urban area, or (b) calculate a deduction in avoided emissions to account for emissions resulting from the Project displacing new development to outside the Project Area (Section 10.5)
- 10.1 Quantifying Biomass Carbon Stock Present Within the Project Area

Acceptable ways of quantifying the biomass carbon stock present within the Project Area include:

A. The afforestation table, Appendix B, from the US Forest Service General Technical Report (GTR) NE-343 appropriate to the geographic area and species, "total nonsoil" carbon stock for stands of the age of the forest on the Project Area. If this method is used, the Project Area must be assessed and divided into stands as by the species grouping in the relevant geographic area in GTR NE-343 and by stand age. Stand age may be determined by publically available historical materials documenting afforestation of the Project Area or presence of substantially complete tree cover on the Project Area. Stand age may be determined by coring a random or well distributed systematic selection of trees. Other methods to determine stand age may be used, subject to approval by the Registry. If the Project Area is classified as one stand, at least 30 co-dominant trees well distributed across the Project Area will be used to calculate stand age. If the Project Area is divided into more than one stand, at least 20 co-dominant trees per stand will be used to determine stand age. For each stand, stand age shall be the median age of the sampled trees.

If using this quantification method in Section 10.1.A, the Project must measure the percent canopy cover. The Project may use i-Tree Canopy or LiDAR, or it may use another method approved by the Registry. The Project may prove canopy cover by using the i-Tree Canopy tool and submitting to the Registry the i-Tree Canopy report for the Project Area, plus the i-Tree Canopy export file containing the coordinates of all evaluated points and the evaluation of each point. If using sampling like i-Tree rather than a wall-to-wall map, enough points must be sampled so that the standard error of the percent canopy cover is less than 10%. The carbon stock attributed to the Project equals:

Project Stock = Stock \* Percent

Where "Project Stock" is the number of tonnes of biomass carbon stock used for subsequent calculations of credits attributed to the project, "Stock" is the live tree or total non-soil carbon stock per acre estimated using tables from GTR NE-343 times the number of acres in the Project Area, and "Percent" is the percent canopy cover.

Because the tables in GTR NE-343 cover a wide range of conditions, some stands will have less carbon stock than the amount estimated by using the tables. If a project estimates carbon stock using these tables, the "Accounting Stock" shall be 80% of the "Project Stock" estimated in the equation above in this subsection. The application of this 80% factor to the calculation of carbon stock using the GTR tables is an additional deduction imposed to make the GTR-based calculation conservative.

- B. An inventory of live trees at least 5" in diameter at 4.5' above the ground (where the height above the ground is measured on the uphill side of the tree) present on the Project Area using i-Tree methods and tools (available from <u>http://www.itreetools.org/</u>). When using this method, the Accounting Stock attributed to the project is the carbon stock calculated by i-Tree, minus one standard error of that estimate. For example, if the mean estimated carbon stock is 100 tonnes, and the standard error is 10 tonnes, then the number of Accounting Stock attributed to the project is 90 tonnes.
- C. A forest inventory using accepted forestry methods and biomass equations that are valid for the species, growth conditions, and tree sizes to which the equations are being applied and that are published

in a peer reviewed publication, by a government agency, or by a notfor-profit organization. The project may choose to include smaller trees, standing dead trees, and/or down dead wood. When using this method, the Accounting Stock attributed to the Project is the mean estimated carbon stock, minus one standard error of that estimate.

#### 10.2 Areas Expected to Remain in Trees After Potential Development

When an area is developed, some trees may be retained. This subsection adjusts the "Accounting Stock" calculated in the preceding subsection to adjust for the fact that even with development, some of the trees within the Project Area may remain, and the carbon in these remaining trees is not emitted during development. To account for these trees that might remain after development, the Project Operator must do the following accounting:

- A. In industrial, commercial, mixed use, and other primarily non-residential zones, 90% of the Accounting Stock on the Project Area is the "Avoided Biomass Emissions"; or
  - B. In residential zones the smaller of:
    - a. 90% of the Accounting Stock, or
    - b. 2 acres per allowed dwelling unit plus 10% of the remaining
       Project Area, calculated as:

Avoided Biomass Emissions = Accounting Stock \* ((2 \* Dwellings) + ((Project Area – (2 \* Dwellings)) \* 0.1))"

Where "Accounting Stock is defined in Section 10.1, "Dwellings" is the number of dwelling units allowed by zoning to be built

within the Project Area, and "Project Area" is the area (in acres) specified by the Project Operator per Section 1.4.

#### 10.3 Re-measurement of Carbon Stock Necessary to Claim Additional Credits for Growth

If the project wishes to claim credits for ongoing tree growth occurring within the Project Area after the Project Commencement, only the quantified increase in biomass carbon from the prior issuance of credits may be requested. Increases may be quantified using any method approved by the Registry in Section 10.1, including deductions for calculation of the "Accounting Stock". The fraction of the "Accounting Stock" of new biomass sequestration in new growth that counts as "Avoided Biomass Emissions" is the same as the fraction that is the number of "Avoided Biomass Emissions" present at the project start date divided by the "Accounting Stock" present at the project start date.

#### 10.4 Quantification of Soil Carbon

The Project may claim avoidance of emissions from soil carbon caused by conversion of soils to impervious surfaces in the Project Area. Avoided soil carbon emissions shall be no more than:

A. On commercial, industrial, and mixed use and other non-residential zones, if the applicable zoning and development rules specify a maximum fraction of parcel area that may be in impervious surface, up to the allowed impervious area may be claimed as avoided conversion to impervious surface. If the applicable zoning and development rules do not limit impervious area, 90% of the Project Area and in commercial, industrial, or mixed use zone may be attributed to being eligible for conversion to impervious surface.

- B. On residential zones, if the applicable zoning and development rules specify a maximum fraction of parcel area that may be in impervious surface, up to the allowed impervious area may be claimed as avoided conversion to impervious surface. If the applicable zoning and development rules do not limit impervious area, 50% of the Project Area that is in a residential zone may be attributed to being eligible for conversion to impervious surface.
- C. For development uses of the project area that retain live vegetation on the ground, such as creation of recreational grass playfields, there are no soil carbon emissions attributed to development. If potential development of the Project Area would include some vegetative cover, and some non-vegetated surface uses (such as parking lots, restrooms associated with playfields, or artificial turf playfields) divide the Project Area into areas with vegetation and without vegetation, and analyze each area separately.

If there is existing impervious surface within the Project Area, that existing impervious area must be subtracted from the potential area of impervious surface under developed use, to calculate net area of avoided impervious surface for calculating avoided soil carbon emissions.

Per acre of avoided impervious surface, the project may claim 120 metric tonnes carbon dioxide equivalent of Avoided Soil Carbon Emissions per acre of net avoided impervious surface. This emission rate is based on research studies showing that when soil is removed from a site and piled with minimal revegetation, 65% of the soil carbon stock is lost, and soil carbon mapping showing that almost all US forest soils have more than 185 metric tonnes carbon dioxide equivalent per acre in the top meter of soil. The calculation is:

Avoided Soil Carbon Emissions = Avoided Impervious Surface \* 120

Where "Avoided Impervious Surface" is the number of acres within the Project Area that are developable according to the requirements of Section 4.3.A, in units of acres, after the adjustments specified in Sections 10.4.A and 10.4.B.

#### 10.5 Calculation of Deduction for Displaced Development

Preventing development of some lands is likely to displace development to other lands. Displacing development to other lands may or may not cause emissions from trees and soil. If development is displaced to locations with no trees but with minimally disturbed soils, there would be no biomass emission attributed to the displacement but there would be soil carbon emissions resulting from the displacement. If development is displaced to previously developed sites, there could be negligible emissions from biomass and soil from sites where development is displaced to.

The project is assigned no emissions from displaced development if:

- A. The Project Operator can identify existing properties within the urban area where the Project Area is located that are in the same or similar zoning classification (or classifications) as the Project Area, and
- B. Those properties could be developed or re-developed to add similar scope and size of development as would have been allowed on the Project Area if it had not been protected. For uses where the potential developed use of the Project Area is vegetated cover, such as grass

playfields, identify properties that are currently without trees that could be developed into the developed vegetated use.

C. The properties in A and B above that could receive displaced development cannot, in the aggregate, have more than 30% tree cover.

If the Project Operator does not identify properties that could be developed or redeveloped to satisfy the demand for development that could have occurred in the Project Area, then emissions from displacement of development are calculated as follows.

- A. Of the total number of tonnes of Avoided Biomass Emissions from within the Project Area, 28.8% are assumed to be emitted from development displaced from the Project Area. Therefore, the number of creditable tonnes of avoided biomass emission is calculated by reducing the number of tonnes of avoided biomass emissions attributed to within the project area by 28.8%. In the sequence of calculations, this reduction is done immediately prior to calculation of Reversal Pool obligations. The calculation is:
  Credits from Avoided Biomass Emissions = Avoided Biomass Emissions \* (1 0.288)
- B. Of the total number of tonnes of Avoided Soil Carbon Emissions from within the Project Area, 57.1% are assumed to be emitted from development displaced from the Project Area. Therefore, the number of creditable tonnes of avoided soil carbon emission is calculated by reducing the number of tonnes of soil carbon emissions attributed to within the project area by 57.1%. In the sequence of calculations, this reduction is done immediately prior to calculation of Reversal Pool

obligations. The number 57.1% is the fraction of U.S. cities that is nonimpervious surface and assumes that some development is displaced to existing impervious surfaces. The calculation is:

Credits from Avoided Soil Emissions = Avoided Soil Carbon Emissions \* (1 - 0.571)

Credits attributed to the Project are the sum of Avoided Biomass Emissions plus Avoided Soil Carbon Emissions, after adjusting for displacement of development as provided for in this section, plus credits for tree growth if growth is quantified.

#### 10.6 Reversal Pool

Of the credits attributed to the project, verified by the Registry, and issued to the project, 90% shall be issued to the Project Operator and 10% shall be transferred to the Registry Reversal Pool.

#### 11. Verification

The Registry will retain a third-party expert to verify compliance with this Tree Preservation Protocol per the requirements set forth herein and per International Standards Organization 14064-3. Specifically, the Registry adopts and utilizes the following standards from ISO 14064-3:

- Upon receiving a Project Report with updated data on eligibility, quantification of carbon, and a request for credits, the Registry will verify a project's compliance with this Protocol. The Registry will maintain its status as a non-profit organization, and will be independent of specific project activities.
- Verification by a third-party expert is justified by the processes and standard set forth below, and by the fact that urban forest projects, unlike many other

types of carbon offset projects, will be conducted in urban areas, by definition. The trees in urban forest projects will be visible to virtually any resident of that urban area, and to anyone who cares to examine project trees.

- The Registry will maintain independence from the activities of projects, will conduct all verification work with ethical conduct and a fair presentation of its verification work, will treat all projects equally with regard to verification, and will conduct its verification work with skill, diligence, and competence.
- The Registry requires a reasonable level of assurance in the accuracy the asserted GHG removals to a reasonable level.
- The verification items identified in Table 11.2 and the following sections are all material elements, and any asserted GHG removals must be free of material errors, misstatements, or omissions regarding those elements.
- The Registry will record, store, and track all quantification and verification data and either display it for public review or make it available for public review upon request.
- The Registry will develop a risk assessment standard to provide a cross-check on data collection and review.
- The Registry will adopt a process for follow-up and maintenance for consistency and continuity.
  - 11.1 Verification of Eligibility Requirements
- Table 11.2 displays the verification for eligibility requirements.

Item	Elements to Verify	Protocol Section	How
1.	PO Identity	1.1	State/local records
2.	PIA	1.2	Signed/received

#### Table 11.2

3.	Location	1.3	Maps/location data
4.	Project Area	1.4	Maps/location data
5.	Right to Receive Credits	1.5	Easement or signed
			Agreement
6.	Commencement	5	Easement/project
			documentation
7.	Project Documentation	4	Check
8.	Project Duration	3	Easement/mgmt. plan
9.	Preservation Commitment	4	Same
10.	No Pre-existing Preservation	4	Project Plan and
			Supporting
			Documentation
11.	Threat of Tree Loss	4	Project Plan and
			Supporting
			Documentation; for all
			of above: Signed PIA

## 12. Verification of Project Operator's Quantification of Carbon

12.1 Quantifying Biomass Carbon Stock Within the Project Area under Section 10.1

What method was used to quantify biomass carbon stock?

A. A. US Forest Service table

- B. B. i-Tree inventory
- C. C. Other inventory

If A, US Forest Service General Technical Report (GTR) NE-343 table:

• Specify the state and forest type (or types) in which the project is located.

- Specify the table (or tables, if more than one forest type) used to estimate biomass carbon stock.
- Describe method for determining stand age. If documentary evidence, provide a copy of the document(s). If by coring, provide the sampling protocol, core data, and age calculation. If the project is measured as one stand and the stand age is measured by coring, are at least 30 trees aged? If the project is more than one stand, are there at least 20 trees cored in each stand? Is the median tree age used as the stand age?
- For each stand, what is the live tree or total non-soil carbon stock from the relevant table(s) in GTR NE-343, in metric tons CO2e/acre? For stand ages between ages given in the table, linearly interpolate. For stand ages older than the oldest age in the table, use the oldest age in the table.
- What is the percent canopy cover?
- If the i-Tree Canopy tool is used to determine the percent canopy cover, provide the i-Tree Canopy report for the Project Area, plus the i-Tree Canopy export file containing the coordinates of all evaluated points and the evaluation of each point.
- What is the i-Tree Canopy estimated percent canopy cover?
- Is the i-Tree Canopy standard error less than 10%?
- What is the "Project Stock" in tCO2e/acre, for each stand?
- Calculate the "Accounting Stock" by multiplying the "Project Stock" times 0.8.
   What is the "Accounting Stock" in tCO2e/acre, for each stand? For each stand, multiply by the number of acres in the stand, and sum for all stands to calculate the total project "Accounting Stock". What is the total project accounting stock?

#### If B, the I-Tree Eco tool inventory method is used:

• What is the version of the inventory method used?

- Provide a copy of the tree data.
- Provide the i-Tree Eco report of the estimated carbon stock, and standard error of the estimate. In tCO2e/acre, for each stand (or stratum), what is the estimated tree carbon stock minus one standard error, for the entire project area, in tCO2e? This is the "Accounting Stock."

#### If C, a different inventory method is used:

 Provide the inventory field protocol, methods for calculating carbon stock from the inventory data, and electronic copy of the inventory data in an Excel or Access file, and a copy of the carbon calculations. Plot locations or plot information should be specific enough that if the Registry chooses, the Registry should be able to identify individual trees that were sampled, and discern sampled trees from trees that were not sampled. Provide inventory accuracy requirements, quality control procedures, and quality assurance procedures. Describe quality control and quality assurance activities performed, and the results of these activities. Provide complete citations of sources of all biomass equations, and demonstration of their applicability. Report the mean estimated carbon stock for the entire project area, in tCO2e, and the standard error of this estimate, in tCO2e. The "Accounting Stock" is the mean estimated carbon stock minus one standard error.

# 12.2 Area Expected to Remain Treed after Development Under Section 10.2

What is the percentage of the acreage of the Project Area that will have trees remaining even after development?

For the fraction of the developable area that is in primarily non-residential zones, multiply the number in 10.2 by 0.9 and report this as the biomass carbon stock that could be lost on development, the "Avoided Biomass Emissions."

For the fraction of the area that is developable in a residential zone per Section 4.3.A, take the lesser of the two bullets immediately below. Section 10.2.B.

- a. 90% of the Accounting Stock, or
- b. 2 acres per allowed dwelling unit plus 10% of the remaining Project Area, calculated as:

Avoided Biomass Emissions = Accounting Stock \* ((2 \* Dwellings) + ((Project Area – (2 \* Dwellings)) \* 0.1))"

Where "Accounting Stock is defined in Section 10.1, "Dwellings" is the number of dwelling units allowed by zoning to be built within the Project Area, and "Project Area" is the area (in acres) specified by the Project Operator under Section 1.4. Note that if less than about 2.2 acres is required per dwelling unit, the equation in this subsection can be ignored because the equation is subsection A immediately above will return a smaller number than this equation.

Report the "Avoided Biomass Emissions." Section 10.2 and 10.3.

#### 12.3 Additional or Ongoing Growth Under Section 10.3

Claiming credits for ongoing growth is optional. If the Project Operator chooses to claim credits for ongoing biomass growth, these claims are made after growth occurs. Quantification of growth may use any of the methods given in section 10.1.

#### 12.4 Quantification of Soil Carbon Under Section 10.4

Non-residential zones under Section 10.4.A. Avoided soil carbon emissions = (Project Area minus pre-existing area of impervious surface) \* 0.9 \* 120. The areas must be in acres. Show the calculation and amount of avoided soil carbon emissions.

Residential zones under Section 10.4.B. If there is a limit on the fraction of the Project Area that may be impervious surface, take the lesser of 50% or the permissible fraction of lots that may be impervious surface. If there is no regulatory limit on the amount of impervious surface, then the fraction of the Project Area that may become impervious is assumed to be 50%. Avoided Soil Carbon emissions, in tCO2e) equals (the Project Area in acres) minus the area of pre-existing impervious surface (in acres)) times the fraction that may become impervious times 120. Show the calculation and amount of avoided soil carbon emissions.

#### 12.5 Displaced Development Under Section 10.5

Identifying available redevelopment options outside the project area under Section 10.5.1. Identifying available redevelopment options outside the Project Area is optional. If the Project Operator does not identify available redevelopment options on parcels with no more than 30% tree cover, deductions for displaced development are applied to the project, as specified in Section 10.5 of the Protocol and below.

For Project Areas in non-residential zones, estimate the number of square feet of built space that could be built on the Project Area, on or above the existing grade. For Project Areas in residential zones, do the same calculation except calculate the number of permitted dwelling units instead of the number of square feet of potential built space.

For Project Areas in non-residential zones, identify specific land parcels within the same Urban Area where the project is located, and that have existing built space, and where at least the number of square feet of built space that could be built on the Project Area could be added to the built space already existing on these other parcels. Other than specific differences in regulations, the criteria used to estimate potential area of built space on the Project Area can be no more restrictive than the criteria used to estimate potential area of built space on the Project Area can be no more restrictive than the criteria used to estimate potential area of built space on the alternative sites. For example, if fire access regulations are used to reduce the area of potential built space attributed to the Project Area, then these same fire access regulations must be applied when estimating potential buildable space on parcels outside the Project Area. Provide addresses or parcel numbers of parcels used in these calculations, and provide annotated calculations.

For Project Areas in residential zones, identify parcels with at least one dwelling unit per parcel, where the parcel could be redeveloped to contain more dwelling units. Identify parcels that could contain as many more dwelling units as could be built on the Project Area. Provide addresses or parcel numbers of the parcels where dwelling units could be added, and annotated calculations of how many dwelling units each parcel could contain, and how many each currently contains.

Deduction for displaced development under Section 10.5. If the Project Operator does not show an option for alternative development within the Urban Area where the Project Area is located, a deduction for displaced development is applied. Displacement of emissions has a biomass component and a soil component. The amount of the biomass deduction for displaced development is the Avoided Biomass Emissions times 0.288. The amount of the soil deduction for displaced development is the Avoided Soil Carbon Emissions times 0.571. Calculate these amounts and show the calculations.

#### 12.6 Total Credits Attributed to the Project

The total credits attributed to the project equals the Avoided Biomass Emissions (section 10.2) plus the Avoided Soil Carbon Emissions (section 10.4) minus biomass and soil emissions attributed to displaced development (section 10.5).

If additional or ongoing growth is calculated, the same procedure is used to calculate growth. The Project Operator may either calculate the growth increment since the most recent quantification (using methods in section 10.1) or may estimate Avoided Biomass Emissions using the post-growth stand age or inventory, and then subtract amounts of credits previously attributed to Avoided Biomass Emissions of the project.

When calculating credits attributed to tree growth, no further credits are attributed for avoided soil emissions unless the allowed area of impervious surface has increased. If the allowed area of impervious surface has increased, to calculate the additional Avoided Soil Carbon Emissions calculate the Avoided Soil Carbon Emissions under the new regulations, and subtract the previously calculated amount of Avoided Soil Carbon Emissions attributed to the project.



## Appendix A

## Project Documentation, Reporting, and Recordkeeping for Tree Planting and Preservation Projects

*Version 5 February 2018* 



Urban Forest Carbon Registry, City Forest Credits, a 501(c)(3) non-profit organization 999 Third Ave. #4600 Seattle, WA 98104 info@ufregistry.org (206) 623-1823

*Copyright © 2016-2018 Urban Forest Carbon Registry dba City Forest Credits. All rights reserved.* 

#### A.1 Documentation to Submit a Project

Project Operators must provide the following documentation to the registry of City Forest Credits (the "Registry").

Document	When Submitted	Content Summary
Project Application	Once, at discretion of Project Operator. Projects commence upon approval of application by Registry	Project Operator, Location, Summary of Project
Project Design Document	Once, within 6 months of approval of application by Registry	Design of Project, Compliance with Eligibility Requirements.
Project Implementation Agreement with the Registry	Once, within 6 months of approval of application by Registry	Agreement between Project Operator and Registry
Signed Declaration of Land Ownership or Permission	With Project Implementation Agreement, or upon any change in ownership or permission	Declaration of Project Operator on Ownership of Land or Permission

# A.2 Documentation for Quantification, Verification, and Request for Issuance of Credits

Project Operators must submit the following documentation on status and to request verification and issuance of credits by the Registry.

Document	When Submitted/Required	Content Summary
Status Reports	Triennially for preservation projects, annually for planting projects, at anniversary of project commencement (approval of project by Registry)	Report confirming Project Operator, operational status, and any significant variations from quantifications to date or Project Design Doc.
Project Reports	Always at end of Project Duration. Before that, per relevant protocol, required before verification or issuance of credits.	Status of Project, Update on Eligibility and Quantification as required by protocols.

## A.3 Reporting During and at End of Project Duration

A Project Report must be submitted at the end of a project's Project Duration. During a project, the Project Operator may submit a Project Report and seek verification and issuance of credits per the relevant protocol. The Registry will issue credits per the requirements in the relevant protocol.

Project Reports must contain:

- a. Any updated information or data on eligibility, and
- b. Any quantification data required by the relevant protocol and appendices.

### A.4 Record Keeping

Project Operators shall keep all documents and forms related to the project for a minimum of the Project Duration required by the relevant protocol. If the Project seeks credits after the Project Duration, it must retain all documents for as long as it

seeks issuance of credits. This information may be requested by the Registry at any time.

#### A.5 Transparency

The Registry requires data transparency for all Projects, including data that displays current carbon stocks, reversals, and quantification of carbon stored. For this reason, all project data reported to the Registry will be publicly available on the Registry's website or by request.